

## 9. TRAINING AND DEVELOPMENT

### Introduction

9.1 Most of government's service delivery is provided through people, directly and indirectly. The success of an organisation, its customers' satisfaction and its efficiency depend heavily on its employees' skills, abilities, knowledge and motivation to work. Investment in people development particularly in focussed skills is no longer a choice. The desired improvement and change required can more likely be achieved by improving the capacity and capability of the people who deliver the services. Having a structured approach to building the capacity of the workforce will therefore continue to positively impact and improve the services delivered to the community.

### Recommendations of the 2008 PRB Report

9.2 The Bureau has in its successive Reports (1998, 2003 and 2008) emphasised the importance of training and development of staff as part of an overall strategy to inculcate a performance culture in Public Sector employees to better serve the citizen's demands and raise the level of professionalism of the Public Service.

9.3 To that end, several recommendations were made in the context of the 2008 PRB Report. Particular emphasis was laid on the strategic content of training and the need for Public Sector Organisations to base their training on identified needs and competencies required to deliver accomplishments that are linked to expected results. The Bureau also recommended organisations to adopt a systematic approach to training; increase their budget allocation for training; provide at least 40 up to 60 hours of training annually to every employee depending upon job grades; and maintain a training information system. Roles of the different parties involved in the training and development function were equally clarified.

### Current Situation

9.4 The overall responsibility for training of public officers is vested upon the Ministry of Civil Service and Administrative Reforms (MCSAR) although each line Ministry/Department has its own annual budget allocation for the training and development of its staff. A few Ministries/Departments/Organisations already have well established in-service training programmes.

9.5 Since 2009, the Human Resource Development Division of the MCSAR has been mounting and organising general training programmes in various job related areas that cut across the Civil Service. The responsibility for nominating officers to attend these courses, however, rests upon the Supervising Officers of the respective Ministries/Departments.

- 9.6 Over 10000 civil servants at different levels of operation including Office Care Attendants, General Services Officers *formerly Officers*, General Services Executives *formerly Senior Officers*, officers from technical/non technical cadres as well as mid career professionals and officers from the top level management have already been trained. This has been done by way of in-house training, sponsorship for award courses/post-graduate schemes and scholarships under bilateral, technical assistance and other schemes.

### **Representations of Federations**

- 9.7 During consultations, and through their respective memoranda most Federations of staff unions have expressed their discontent on the low priority from Ministries/Departments/Organisations to provide training to their employees. They argued that sufficient training was not being offered to employees at some level and also averred that PRB recommendations regarding the annual minimum number of hours of training to be imparted to every employee were not being implemented. The situation was reportedly more critical in Parastatal Bodies and Local Authorities where grades at the lowest echelon barely received any training.
- 9.8 Proposals were put forward for: the setting up of a Civil Service College to cater for the training needs of all employees in the Public Sector; carrying out regular training needs analysis at intervals of two to three years; providing at least 72 hours of training to all employees; designing training courses in conjunction with Tertiary Education Institutions; introducing new methods of training such as distance learning, on-line training; coaching and mentoring; strengthening on-the-job training, monitoring of the training budget to ensure that relevant training programmes are carried out; monitoring and taking of actions by the MCSAR in respect of organisations which fail to provide training to their employees and greater interaction between public and private sector in the field of training.

### **Submissions of the MCSAR**

- 9.9 The MCSAR views that with the rapid pace of globalisation and the expected adverse effects of the economic crisis, as well as any unforeseen externalities, new areas of Public Sector competency will need to be strengthened, in particular, diversity management, leadership, knowledge management, resource and information management, negotiation skills, communication and ICT skills amongst others. Reforms initiatives need to be addressed concurrently with the capacity building process. To further improve and enhance Public Sector service delivery, there is need to address both, what is being done through Public Sector reform and the capacity to do it through empowerment by learning.

## **Government Policy**

9.10 Government is committed towards the training of its employees and in promoting lifelong learning in the public sector to keep public officers abreast of modern techniques of management and public administration. This is evident in the Acting President's Address of April 2012 which proposes the introduction of legislation to set up a Civil Service College.

## **Situation in other Countries**

9.11 Research has shown that most developed countries pay great regard to the continual process of training and retraining to improve the knowledge and skills of their employees.

### **Canada**

9.12 Canada has a policy of continuous learning for its permanent employees who are provided with the opportunity to create their personal learning programme.

### **China**

9.13 All civil servants are trained in rotation within five years so that every civil servant can attend off job training which averages at least 12 days per year.

### **Malaysia**

9.14 Every Public Sector employee is provided with a minimum of seven training days per year. Public service employees are encouraged to undergo training to enhance their skills in their respective scope of work.

### **Singapore**

9.15 Every civil servant is entitled to 100 hours of training each year of which 60% is on work related courses and 40% on self development courses.

## **Survey on Training and Development**

9.16 The reported shortcomings in the training and development functions prompted the Bureau to conduct a survey thereon to assess the prevailing situation.

9.17 A self completion survey questionnaire was designed and sent to Chief Executives of Ministries/Departments/Organisations, requesting them to furnish information on the various aspects of their training and development activities.

9.18 Response to the survey was satisfactory - out of 179 questionnaires that were sent, 92 completed ones were returned to the Bureau.

9.19 The main results of the survey are given below:

- Only 30% of the organisations had a training plan for all staff that was communicated at all levels.

- During the past 12 months, 31% of organisations conducted a Training Needs Analysis for all staff. Training Needs Assessments (TNA) were mostly realised through general recommendations made by the Heads of Ministries/Departments/Organisations.
- Lack of time was stated as the main reason by 24% of the organisations for not conducting a TNA.
- Half of organisations stated that training provided was based on perceived individual and organisational needs and was more targeted at managerial and core operational staff.
- Types of training proposed to staff involved workshop/seminars (82%), on-the-job training and lectures (70%) and classroom lectures at the MCSAR (42%).
- The majority of organisations (60%) have not been able to implement the minimum annual training requirements for all staff as recommended by the Bureau.
- The average minimum number of hours of training proposed per categories were as follows: minor grades (30 hours), clerical, executive and technical grades (40 hours) and administrative, professional and above (55 hours)
- About 80% of organisations have a Training Committee that deals with the issue of Staff Training.
- Most organisations (86%) felt that there was need for greater involvement of tertiary institutions in public service training and development.
- There are significant variations in the Budget that the organisations assign to training ranging from less than 1% to 10%.
- About 50% of organisations did not utilise their entire training budget for the year 2011.
- Some 40% of organisations were evaluating the effect of training provided to staff, through observations of improvements that could be detected in output.
- Inadequate funding and providing training to all staff were major problems faced by half of the organisations.
- According to 75% of organisations surveyed, the training function could be improved by carefully designing training programmes and introducing mechanisms to monitor and evaluate training.
- The need for a centralised body to be responsible for the training of Public Sector employees was proposed by about 73% of organisations to improve the training function.

## Discussions and Conclusion

- 9.20 The above findings indicate that there is uneven provision of training to staff with the majority of Public Sector Organisations having not been able to implement the minimum annual number of training hours recommended. It may accordingly be inferred that priority and importance attributed to training of employees also vary among organisations. To reinforce the public service training functions, organisations proposed more involvement of tertiary institutions and the setting up of a centralised body for training. It was also suggested that further improvement could be brought by carefully designing training programmes and introducing mechanisms to monitor and evaluate training dispensed.
- 9.21 As a critical component of Human Resource Development, we believe that training people is fundamental in enhancing public service delivery. To keep pace with the increasing demands for high performance, improvement, modernisation and efficiency, one alternative is to attract, retain and motivate already skilled people while the other one is to train, develop inside people, build the relevant skills and capacity needed for organisational success.
- 9.22 After considering all relevant factors, including the survey results and arguments put forward by parties, we are making recommendations to encourage organisations to provide training and development activities in a more systematic manner with a focus on the acquisition of competencies both technical and attitudinal.

## Recommendation 1

### 9.23 We recommend that:

- (i) organisations should adopt a systematic approach to training with training needs of staff assessed, the design of their training based on the acquisition of the required competencies and attitudes for effective job performance/service delivery and monitoring and evaluation of training activities done;
- (ii) training programmes should be geared to build the knowledge, skills attitudes and motivation required by serving employees and new entrants in the service to perform effectively in their present job and be prepared for future responsibilities they are likely to assume;
- (iii) the MCSAR should organise generic training programmes targeted at increasing the employees' sense of responsibility and accountability in order to enhance their motivation and commitment towards a performance based and service oriented culture; and
- (v) organisations should provide regular training programmes in continuous service improvement to instil the desired behaviour and necessary mindset in employees for providing a quality service.

## Training Needs Assessment

- 9.24 The survey indicates that only about a third of organisations plan the training of their staff on the basis of an assessment of either employee or organisational needs.
- 9.25 **The Bureau considers that Training is an investment that the organisation makes in itself with the desired end of improving individual/organisation performance.** Thus, it becomes important that training needs be properly identified otherwise the training itself may be called into question. This was thoroughly canvassed during meetings with Management and Unions which were requested to submit a list of courses that they regard as relevant to their needs. A consolidated list of these courses has been compiled and presented at Annex to this Chapter. We consider that the list, though not exhaustive, may serve as a useful input to ease the training needs assessment of Public Sector employees. We are, hereunder, making recommendations to facilitate the planning phase of training.

## Recommendation 2

### 9.26 We recommend that:

- (i) **organisations should come up with Training plans for all their staff based on a detailed assessment, examination and prioritisation of employee and organisational needs. The plan may be spread over a time period as deemed appropriate by Management to ensure that all staff are provided with meaningful training;**
- (ii) **expressed rather than perceived needs of staff should be assessed and situated within the broader organisation needs and priorities that are to be met in order to improve service delivery, satisfy customers, and promote greater efficiency and effectiveness;**
- (iii) **training should be targeted at those activities which add value to both individual and organisation performance by improving knowledge, skills and attitude that can be transferred to the job;**
- (iv) **organisations should demonstrate greater commitment to invest in staff by making the Training Needs Assessment an integral part of the management process;**
- (v) **mount such in-house formal service training that can be reasonably done at the level of organisation; and**
- (v) **training plans should be used as a tool for prospective retirees to plan how and where to transfer their skills and knowledge to their co-workers.**

## Design

9.27 Once a need has been identified, it becomes crucial to design training programmes accordingly. Organisations can undertake to design training programmes only when there are clear training objectives specifying what goals have to be achieved by the end of the programmes.

### Recommendation 3

9.28 We recommend that:

- (i) training should be geared towards improving the performance of individual employees and the service delivery taking into consideration the difficulties associated with their everyday job activities and the evolving needs of the organisation;
- (ii) individual departments should design training courses on the basis of the measurable core competencies required by the different grades as identified by the Performance Management System;
- (iii) training should be designed on the basis of information obtained from a training needs assessment to provide specific information on what employees need to learn following which training objectives can be set and the content of training developed. All along the design process, organisations should ensure an optimal fit between individual and organisational needs;
- (iv) training objectives specifying what is required in terms of application of the learning to real life work situation should be set. These should indicate what the employee should be able to do after the training and also identify and specify the desired observable behaviour and attitude that is sought for effective job performance and delivering public services to meet the expectations of citizens and clients;
- (v) organisations should forward those identified training needs that cannot be dealt with at their level to the MCSAR together with such details as the grades and number of officers concerned;
- (vi) new entrants to the Public Service should be provided with induction and orientation training so that they are clear about their roles and responsibilities and what is expected from them by way of individual and collective contributions;
- (vii) training courses in people management skills should be provided to officers in positions with staff responsibilities;
- (viii) necessary training in customer care should be given to all officers having an interface with customers so that they can better assume their responsibilities towards them; and
- (ix) development programmes combining leadership, diversity management, knowledge management, change management, talent management, strategic planning and interpersonal skills should be

mounted for key management and leadership positions across cadres. Such programmes should also be aimed at developing those officers irrespective of the cadre they belong, who have shown the knowledge, attributes, personality traits and abilities/skills/competencies either in terms of potential or in a demonstrated manner.

### **Training Methods**

9.29 Depending on their respective prevailing circumstances and resources, organisations can choose to deliver training and development in a variety of ways ranging from learning on-the-job, on-line training, distance learning or participation in workshop/seminar to specific off-the-job training tailored to a particular purpose. It goes without saying that careful selection of training methods leads to a better chance of success of training programmes.

### **Recommendation 4**

9.30 We recommend that in choosing the suitability of a training method, organisations should consider training objectives, the needs and characteristics of the employees, complexity and volume of the learning task, available logistic and the financial implications involved.

9.31 Non conventional methods of training such as coaching, mentoring, job rotation and delegation, among others, should also be used and included in training plans.

9.32 Organisations should set a priority to on-the-job training for the upskilling of their employees. This should not preclude organisations from adopting a combination of formal training programmes away from desks, on-the-job training and self-managed learning to suit their prevailing circumstances.

### **Training Budget**

9.33 The survey findings indicate that there are significant variations in the budget that the different organisations assign to training. While significant amount of resources are allocated to train specialised personnel by a few organisations, others spend insignificant sums to train their staff. This situation needs to be rectified.

### **Recommendation 5**

9.34 We recommend that:

- (i) organisations should allocate a minimum of 1 % of their salary bill as budget to be spent on the training and development of their employees subject to practicability and availability of funds; and
- (ii) the Training Committee set up under each organisation should establish training priorities and periodically monitor the training



**budget to ensure that allocated funds are efficiently and effectively utilised.**

### Amount of Training

- 9.35 In the last PRB Report, we recommended that organisations should ensure that all employees are provided with a minimum number of hours of training annually depending upon their occupational categories.
- 9.36 Management and the staff side have argued and the survey has confirmed that organisations have not been able to provide training to all the staff for one reason or another. It was also voiced out that due to the size and specific circumstances of certain organizations, it was very difficult to satisfy the minimum annual training requirements of all employees.
- 9.37 **Notwithstanding the arguments put forward, the Bureau considers that employees should not be debarred from training opportunities. We believe that with the necessary commitment, planning and effort, the recommended minimum training can be dispensed to all employees.** Such training should not necessarily be off site but should include among others on-the-job training and work practices, assignments or participation in special projects which have the merit of not taking the trainee away from his work place.

### Recommendation 6

- 9.38 **We recommend that Organisations should ensure that all their employees irrespective of grade are provided with a minimum number of hours of meaningful work related training opportunities. The minimum number of hours of training per year for the different occupational groups should be indicatively as follows:**

<b>Occupational Group</b>	<b>Hours of Training per year</b>
Minor Grades	40
Clerical, Executive and Technical	45
Administrative, Professional and above	60

### Training Information System

- 9.39 It is essential for organisations to keep data on their training activities to enable informed decision taking. As revealed by the survey, only half of the organisations are doing so.

## Recommendation 7

**9.40 We recommend that Ministries/Departments/Organisations should keep proper and updated records of all training activities carried out in respect of each of their officers. Information such as training needs identified by Management and/or expressed by staff as well as the ways and means of meeting those needs should be recorded. The amount of training provided annually to each officer whether on-the-job, off site, online or by distance learning as well as observable benefits/shortcomings/results of training dispensed should also be recorded.**

## Monitoring and Evaluation of Training

9.41 People are trained with the ultimate aim of improving performance and result. Without appropriate measures, targets or time frames it is difficult to determine the continued relevance of certain training activities. Organisations can no longer afford to keep on providing training programmes without any monitoring and evaluation mechanism to their effectiveness in bringing the desired result. To guide such mechanism, key performance indicators/measures need to be established - a process that is facilitated by the Performance Management System which identifies competency and attitude gaps. The use of performance measures has the additional merit of improving both internal and external accountability.

## Recommendation 8

**9.42 We recommend that:**

- (i) key performance indicators/measures which take into account agreed performance objectives, targets and expectations should be used by organisations for the monitoring and evaluation of training programmes at work unit and employee level;**
- (ii) for Executives and Management, the monitoring and evaluating mechanism should be guided by criteria such as customer satisfaction, innovation and accomplishment of goals; and**
- (iii) organisations should make use of the appraisal under the Performance Management System to identify competency and attitude gaps, if any, that might stand in the way of good performance and update their initial training needs based on the competency and other attitude gaps.**

## Roles and Responsibilities

9.43 The three key players in the Public Sector Training and Development strategy are employees, Management of organisations and the MCSAR. Each has complementary roles and responsibilities to make Training and Development achieve its target of improving performance, preparedness for shouldering higher responsibilities and service delivery. The MCSAR dispenses training to public officers to upgrade their skills and knowledge. It is also responsible for the

development of expertise and new skills through distance learning. On their part, Ministries/Departments/Organisations have the corporate responsibility to ensure sustained performance and productivity through training and development of their human resources. Staff on the other hand, have the professional obligation to update their knowledge and improve their skills to remain efficient and effective members of the public service.

## **Recommendation 9**

### **9.44 We recommend that the MCSAR should:**

- (i) monitor and evaluate training courses it provides to its staff as well as to staff of other Ministries/Departments through a systematic assessment of competencies and performance before and after training, in addition to the evaluation using assessment sheets at the end of the training session;**
- (ii) ensure that organisations adopt a systematic approach to training with their training needs assessment, the design of their training based on the identified needs to improve employee performance and attitude, and monitoring and evaluation of training activities done; and**
- (iii) in collaboration with concerned Ministries/Departments and through the assistance of the State Law Office, mount short training courses in prosecution matters for those officers who perform prosecution duties.**

### **9.45 We further recommend that organisations should:**

- (i) provide employees with the necessary feedback on the desirable competencies, attitudes and mindset that are appropriate to their current role and necessary for their future personal development;**
- (ii) facilitate the process for individuals to acquire the required competencies and attributes for improved performance;**
- (iii) create such environment as may be appropriate to ease the obtention of additional qualifications required to cross Qualification Bar (QB) or for appointment or promotion; and**
- (iv) expedite the setting up of the Training Committee, unless this has already been done, and submit the details of its composition to the MCSAR.**

### **9.46 We also recommend that:**

- (i) employees at all levels should increasingly take a proactive role in their own professional development, assuming responsibility for continuous learning to improve their performances behaviourally and technically. They should use every opportunity to learn on or off-the-job through work practices, assignments or participation in**

special projects or to subscribe to learning through distance learning methods;

- (ii) both the trainee and Management should monitor and evaluate the impact of ongoing/completed training and development programmes on a regular basis, and take necessary corrective actions for the benefits of customers both internal and external; and
- (iii) an officer who fails to attend up to the completion/complete a course or training, for which he has been nominated, should refund the full cost of the expenses incurred by Government within a period of three months from the date of abandonment of the course or training.

## ANNEX

**List of Training Programmes**

<b>1</b>	<b>Human Resource Management</b>	
	1.1	Managerial Skills
	1.2	Team Building
	1.3	360 <sup>0</sup> Leadership
	1.4	Resource Conflicts/Conflict Management
	1.5	Train the Trainers
	1.6	Emotional Intelligence
	1.7	HRM in the Civil Service
	1.8	HR as a strategic partner
	1.9	HR planning
	1.10	Job Analysis and Evaluation Workshop
	1.11	Learning beyond limits
	1.12	Manager as a Facilitator
	1.13	Leadership Skills
	1.14	Human Resources - Budgetary and Control
	1.15	Management Services
	1.16	Management Development
	1.17	Strategic and Change Management
<b>2</b>	<b>Law</b>	
	2.1	Property Legislation
	2.2	Legal Systems & Basic Administrative Law
	2.3	Basic Contract Law
	2.4	Company Law
	2.5	Basic Copyright

	2.6	Legal Drafting
	2.7	Prosecution duties
	2.8	Industrial Relations
	2.9	Health and Safety
	2.10	Road Safety Measures
	2.11	Parliamentary Administration
	2.12	Judicial Administration
<b>3</b>	<b>Information Technology</b>	
	3.1	CAMA (Computer Assisted Mass Appraisal) Software
	3.2	Basic IT (IC3 Core etc.)
	3.3	LAVIMS project (SPSS or NCSS)
	3.4	Computer and Cyber Security
	3.5	Networking Application
	3.6	Refresher Course in Word, Excel, etc.
	3.7	Digitalisation
	3.8	Management Information Systems(MIS)
	3.9	Geographical Information System (GIS)
<b>4</b>	<b>Public Finance</b>	
	4.1	Financial Accounting/ Financial Management
	4.2	Public Accountability and Internal Controls
	4.3	Costing and Collection of Resources
	4.4	General Financial Processes
	4.5	Audit Principles
	4.6	Principles of Valuation

<b>5</b>	<b>Procurement and Contract Management</b>	
	5.1	Contract Management
	5.2	Managing the Purchasing Function for Government Procurement Officers
	5.3	Strategic Approach to Procurement
	5.4	Procurement Management
	5.5	Methodologies for examination and evaluation of bids
	5.6	Procurement Planning and Methods
	5.7	Project Management
	5.8	Contracting out and Privatisation of Services
<b>6</b>	<b>Communication Skills</b>	
	6.1	Effective Communication
	6.2	Effective Writing
	6.3	Preparing Policy papers and conveying changes
	6.4	Writing reports and proposals
<b>7</b>	<b>Customer Care</b>	
	7.1	Creative Customer service
	7.2	Creating excellence in telephone service
	7.3	Professional Image Course (creating the first impression the last)
	7.4	Public Relations
<b>8</b>	<b>Organisational Excellence</b>	
	8.1	Knowledge Management
	8.2	Risk Management
	8.3	Quality Management (ISO)
	8.4	Benchmarking using TRADE Methodology
	8.5	Time Management

<b>9</b>	<b>Reforms</b>	
	9.1	Management of Civil Service Reforms
<b>10</b>	<b>Good Governance</b>	
	10.1	Fraud and Corruption: Preventive Measures
<b>11</b>	<b>General Services</b>	
	11.1	Registry Procedures
	11.2	Management of Registries and Public Relations
	11.3	Secretarial Duties
	11.4	Skills to operate modern equipment (photocopy, fax, etc).
<b>12</b>	<b>Environmental Issues</b>	
	12.1	Enforcement of Environmental issues
	12.2	Solid Waste Management
	12.3	Food Processing, Dairy Industry, Breeding Agronomy
	12.4	Fruit Fly Control and Integrated Pest Management.
<b>13</b>	<b>Public Infrastructure</b>	
	13.1	Building Construction
	13.2	Basic Surveying
	13.3	Quantity Surveying
	13.4	Architecture
	13.5	Urban Planning
	13.6	Development Control Mechanism in different context in developed/developing countries
	13.7	Introduction to Civil Engineering
	13.8	Refresher Course in Building Construction
<b>14</b>	<b>Short Courses in Trades</b>	
	14.1	Masonry (Tiling, Panel Partitioning, etc.)
	14.2	Carpentry



	14.3	Diesel and Petrol Mechanics
	14.4	Gardening
	14.5	Road Construction
	14.6	Welding
	14.7	Pipe Fitting
	14.8	Painting
	14.9	Electrical Installations

\*\*\*\*\*